CALIFORNIA TAX CREDIT ALLOCATION COMMITTEE

Project Staff Report 2013 First Round June 12, 2013 <u>REVISED</u>

Project Number CA-13-090

Project Name Fresno Rental Assistance Demonstration (RAD)

Site Address: 4216 E. Hamilton Avenue & 510 South Peach Avenue

Fresno, CA 93702 & 93727 County: Fresno

Census Tract: 0013.04 & 0029.03

 Tax Credit Amounts
 Federal/Annual
 State/Total

 Requested:
 \$1,676,407
 \$5,588,023

 Recommended:
 \$1,676,407
 \$5,588,023

Applicant Information

Applicant: Housing Authority of the City of Fresno

Contact: Preston Prince
Address: 1331 Fulton Mall

Fresno, CA 93721

Phone: 559-443-8475 Fax: 559-445-8981

Email: pprince@fresnohousing.org

General partner(s) or principal owner(s): Housing Authority of the City of Fresno

Silvercrest, Inc.

General Partner Type: Nonprofit

Developer: Housing Authority of the City of Fresno
Investor/Consultant: California Housing Partnership Corporation

Management Agent(s): GSF Properties

Project Information

Construction Type: Acquisition & Rehabilitation

Total # Residential Buildings: 83 Total # of Units: 193

No. & % of Tax Credit Units: 191 100% Federal Set-Aside Elected: 40%/60%

Federal Subsidy: HUD Section 8 Project-Based Contract (191 Units - 100%)

Affordability Breakdown by Units and % (Lowest Income Points):

30% AMI: 21 10 % 45% AMI: 49 25 % 50% AMI: 77 40 %

Information

Set-Aside: N/A

Housing Type: Large Family

Geographic Area: Central Valley Region TCAC Project Analyst: Benjamin Schwartz

Unit Mix

33 1-Bedroom Units

80 2-Bedroom Units

36 3-Bedroom Units

33 4-Bedroom Units

10 5-Bedroom Units

1 6-Bedroom Units

192 Total Units

			Proposed
	2013 Rents Targeted	2013 Rents Actual	Rent
	% of Area Median	% of Area Median	(including
t Type & Number	Income	Income	utilities)
1 Bedroom	30%	30%	\$322
2 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$387
3 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$447
4 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$498
5 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$550
6 Bedrooms	30%	30%	\$601
1 Bedroom	45%	45%	\$484
2 Bedrooms	45%	45%	\$580
3 Bedrooms	45%	45%	\$670
4 Bedrooms	45%	45%	\$748
5 Bedrooms	45%	45%	\$825
1 Bedroom	50%	45%	\$484
2 Bedrooms	50%	45%	\$580
3 Bedrooms	50%	45%	\$670
4 Bedrooms	50%	45%	\$748
5 Bedrooms	50%	45%	\$825
1 Bedroom	60%	45%	\$484
2 Bedrooms	60%	45%	\$580
3 Bedrooms	60%	45%	\$670
4 Bedrooms	60%	45%	\$748
5 Bedrooms	60%	45%	\$825
2 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$0
3 Bedrooms	Manager's Unit	Manager's Unit	\$0
	1 Bedrooms 2 Bedrooms 3 Bedrooms 4 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 6 Bedrooms 1 Bedrooms 2 Bedrooms 3 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 1 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 1 Bedrooms 2 Bedrooms 3 Bedrooms 3 Bedrooms 4 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 5 Bedrooms 6 Bedrooms 7 Bedrooms 7 Bedrooms 8 Bedrooms 8 Bedrooms 9 Bedrooms	t Type & Number Income 1 Bedroom 30% 2 Bedrooms 30% 3 Bedrooms 30% 4 Bedrooms 30% 5 Bedrooms 30% 6 Bedrooms 30% 1 Bedroom 45% 2 Bedrooms 45% 3 Bedrooms 45% 5 Bedrooms 45% 1 Bedroom 50% 2 Bedrooms 50% 3 Bedrooms 50% 4 Bedrooms 50% 5 Bedrooms 60% 2 Bedrooms 60% 3 Bedrooms 60% 5 Bedrooms 60%	t Type & Number Income Income 1 Bedroom 30% 30% 2 Bedrooms 30% 30% 3 Bedrooms 30% 30% 4 Bedrooms 30% 30% 5 Bedrooms 30% 30% 6 Bedrooms 30% 30% 1 Bedroom 45% 45% 2 Bedrooms 45% 45% 3 Bedrooms 45% 45% 4 Bedrooms 45% 45% 5 Bedrooms 45% 45% 1 Bedroom 50% 45% 2 Bedrooms 50% 45% 3 Bedrooms 50% 45% 4 Bedrooms 50% 45% 5 Bedrooms 50% 45% 5 Bedrooms 50% 45% 5 Bedrooms 60% 45%

Project Financing Residential

Estimated Total Project Cost:	\$31,845,360	Construction Cost Per Square Foot:	\$75
Estimated Residential Project Cost:	\$31,845,360	Per Unit Cost:	\$165,002

Construction Financing

Constitution I in	uncing	i ci illunciit i illunci	~~5
Source	Amount	Source	Amount
US Bank	\$16,533,761	HA City of Fresno	\$3,600,000
HA City of Fresno	\$3,600,000	HA City of Fresno Seller Financing	\$7,877,000
HA City of Fresno Seller Financing	\$7,877,000	Housing Relinquished Fund Corp	\$600,000
Housing Relinquished Fund Corp	\$600,000	Tax Credit Equity	\$19,768,360
Costs Deferred Until Perm Loan Closis	ng \$1,370,460	TOTAL	\$31,845,360
Tax Credit Equity	\$1,864,139		

Permanent Financing

Determination of Credit Amount(s)

Determination of Credit A	mount(s)	
Requested Eligible Basis (R	ehabilitation):	\$18,626,742
130% High Cost Adjustmen	t:	No
Applicable Fraction:		100.00%
Qualified Basis (Rehabilitat	ion):	\$18,626,742
Applicable Rate:		9.00%
Total Maximum Annual Fed	leral Credit:	\$1,676,407
Total State Credit:		\$5,588,023
Approved Developer Fee in	Project Cost:	\$2,000,000
Approved Developer Fee in	Eligible Basis:	\$1,400,000
Investor/Consultant:	California Housing Partr	nership Corporation
Federal Tax Credit Factor:		\$0.96400
State Tax Credit Factor:		\$0.64563

Per Regulation Section 10322(i)(4)(A), The "as if vacant" land value and the existing improvement value established at application, as well as the eligible basis amount derived from those values, will be used during all subsequent reviews including the placed in service review, for the purpose of determining the final award of Tax Credits.

Per Regulation Section 10327(c)(2)(C), Once established at the initial funded application, the developer fee cannot be increased, but may be decreased, in the event of a modification in basis.

Eligible Basis and Basis Limit

Requested Unadjusted Eligible Basis: \$18,626,742 Actual Eligible Basis: \$27,069,799 **Unadjusted Threshold Basis Limit:** \$39,604,357 \$39,604,357 Total Adjusted Threshold Basis Limit:

Adjustments to Basis Limit: None

Tie-Breaker Information

First: **Large Family** 61.241% Second:

Cost Analysis and Line Item Review

Staff analysis of project costs to determine reasonableness found all fees to be within TCAC's underwriting guidelines and TCAC limitations. Annual operating expenses exceed the minimum operating expenses established in the Regulations, and the project pro forma shows a positive cash flow from year one. Staff has calculated federal tax credits based on 9.00% of the qualified basis, or, in the case of acquisition credit or credit combined with federal subsidies, 3.20%. Applicants are cautioned to consider the expected federal rate when negotiating with investors. TCAC's financial evaluation at project completion will determine the final allocation.

Special Issues/Other Significant Information: None

Legal Status: Staff has reviewed the Applicant's responses to the questions contained in the Legal Status portion of the Application. No information was disclosed that raised any question regarding the financial viability or legal integrity of the applicant.

Local Reviewing Agency:

The Local Reviewing Agency, City of Fresno, has completed a site review of this project and strongly supports this project.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Committee make a preliminary reservation of tax credits in the following amount(s) contingent upon standard conditions and any additional conditions imposed by the Committee:

Federal Tax Credits/Annual \$1.676.407 State Tax Credits/Total \$5,588,023

Standard Conditions

The applicant must submit all documentation required for a Carryover Allocation, any Readiness to Proceed Requirements elected, and a Final Reservation. Failure to provide the documentation at the time required may result in rescission of the Credit reservation and cancellation of a carryover allocation.

TCAC makes the preliminary reservation only for the project specified above in the form presented, and involving the parties referred to in the application. No changes in the development team or the project as presented will be permitted without the express approval of TCAC.

The applicant must pay TCAC a performance deposit and allocation fee calculated in accordance with regulation. Additionally, TCAC requires the project owner to pay a monitoring fee before issuance of tax forms.

As project costs are preliminary estimates only, staff recommends that a reservation be made in the amount of federal credit and state credit shown above on condition that the final project costs be supported by itemized lender approved costs and certified costs after the buildings are placed in service.

All unexpended funds in reserve accounts established for the project must remain with the project to be used for the benefit of the property and/or its residents, except for the portion of any accounts funded with deferred developer fees.

All fees charged to the project must be within TCAC limitations. Fees in excess of these limitations will not be considered when determining the amount of credit when the project is placed-in-service.

The applicant/owner shall be subject to underwriting criteria set forth in Section 10327 of the regulations through the final feasibility analysis performed by TCAC at placed-in-service.

Credit awards are contingent upon applicant's acceptance of any revised total project cost, qualified basis and tax credit amount determined by TCAC in its final feasibility analysis.

The applicant must ensure the project meets all Additional Threshold Requirements of the proposed project. If points were awarded for service amenities, the applicant will be required to provide such amenity or amenities identified in the application, for a minimum period of ten years and at no cost to the tenants. Applicants that received points for sustainable building methods (energy efficiency) must submit the certification required by Section 10325(c)(6) at project completion. Applicants that received increases (exceptions to limits) in the threshold basis limit under Section 10327(c)(5) must submit the certification required by Section 10322(i)(2) at project completion.

Additional Conditions: None

Points System	Max. Possible	Requested	Points
Points System	Points	Points	Awarded
Cost Efficiency / Credit Reduction / Public Funds	20	20	20
Public Funds	20	20	20
Owner / Management Characteristics	9	9	9
General Partner Experience	6	6	6
Management Experience	3	3	3
Housing Needs	10	10	10
Site Amenities	15	15	15
SITE 1			
Within ¼ mile of transit stop, service every 30 minutes in rush hours	6	6	6
Within ½ mile of public park or community center open to general public	2	2	2
Within ½ mile of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	4	4	4
Within 1 mile of a public high school	3	3	3
Within ¼ mile of a pharmacy	2	2	2
SITE 2			
Within ¼ mile of transit stop, service every 30 minutes in rush hours	6	6	6
Within ¼ mile of public park or community center open to general public	3	3	3
Within ½ mile of public library	2	2	2
Within 1.5 miles of a full-scale grocery/supermarket of at least 25,000 sf	3	3	0
Within ½ mile of a public middle school	3	3	3
Within 1 mile of medical clinic or hospital	2	2	2
Service Amenities	10	10	10
LARGE FAMILY, SENIOR, AT-RISK HOUSING TYPES			
Service Coordinator, minimum ratio of 1 FTE to 1,000 bedrooms	3	3	3
Adult ed/health & wellness/skill bldg classes, minimum 84 hrs/yr instruction	7	7	7
Sustainable Building Methods	10	10	10
REHABILITATION			
Rehabilitate to improve energy efficiency (change in HERS II rating): 25%	7	7	7
Additional rehab measures: Sustainable Building Mgmt Practices	3	3	3
Lowest Income	52	52	52
Basic Targeting	50	50	50
Deeper Targeting – at least 10% of units @ 30% AMI or less	2	2	2
Readiness to Proceed	20	20	20
Miscellaneous Federal and State Policies	2	2	2
State Credit Substitution	2	2	2
Total Points	148	148	148

<u>Please Note:</u> If more than the maximum Site Amenity points were requested, not all amenities may have been scored and/or verified.

DO NOT RELY ON SCORING IN THIS COMPETITIVE CYCLE FOR FUTURE APPLICATIONS. ALL RE-APPLICATIONS ARE REVIEWED WITHOUT RELIANCE ON PAST SCORING.